

# Educational Technology of the Liberal Arts and Sciences Model Application in the Training of Lawyers

**Marina A. Dorofeeva**

PhD in History, Associate Professor, Law School, Far Eastern Federal University, Vladivostok, Russian Federation; dorofeeva.ma@dvfu.ru

## ABSTRACT

This article describes the methods of teaching critical thinking to law students. Problems of the lack of functional literacy and weak critical thinking, which are crucial for successful professional activity in the conditions of the fourth industrial revolution, among junior students are presented. The authors propose to apply the methods of the Liberal Arts and Sciences within the disciplines of theory of state and law, history of state and law, philosophy of law, history of political and legal doctrines, history of legal science, etc. to correct functional illiteracy and form critical thinking.

**Keywords:** legal education, liberal arts and sciences, soft skills, critical thinking, functional illiteracy

In the 21st century, due to the reality of the fourth industrial revolution, legal profession and legal education (like all social institutions) find themselves in the world of VUCA — a world of variability, uncertainty, complexity and ambiguity. The requirements for employees imposed by the fourth industrial revolution are also reflected in the system of higher education.

Firstly, modern society declares Talent Management. K. Schwab is convinced that in the future talent will be a critical factor of production to a greater extent than capital. The labor market will be increasingly divided into segments of low-skilled / low-paid and high skilled / high-paid<sup>11</sup>. Nowadays it is not the firm that chooses the person, but the person who chooses the firm<sup>12</sup>. The fourth industrial revolution generates the principle of uniqueness of the creator of a product / service as a driver of success. There is a different worldview, a new vision, based on the fact that employees are perceived as a strategic resource that forms the uniqueness. In this regard, the individuality of a professional creator comes out in the first place. Thus, any higher education system has a primary task to disclose a personal potential in addition to the formation of professional knowledge and qualities.

Secondly, the challenge to Russian higher education is compounded by the problem of new competition. In a number of professions, there is already competition between a person and AI. WEF experts predict that the ratio of tasks performed by people and machines in the basic twelve industries in 2018 (on average 71% and 29%) will change significantly in favor of the latter by 2022 (58% and 42%, respectively). Among others, the working places and professional roles of lawyers fell into the category of 'Redundant', that is, they can be subject to automation<sup>13</sup>.

Thus, the question arises: what should a graduate of the Faculty of Law (or a law university) be able to do in order self-realize in the knowledge economy and successfully compete with an AI?

Based on the conducted research, WEF experts claim that the following skills are already in high demand in the labor market:

- analytical thinking and the ability to generate innovations;
- technological design skills;
- design technology and programming skills;
- skills of analysis and evaluation of systems.

However, the most competitive will be professionals with developed 'human' skills, since it is not expected that they can be automated in the near future, such as:

- creativity, originality and initiative;
- critical thinking, detailed analysis;
- comprehensive problem solving;

<sup>11</sup> See: Schwab Klaus. The Fourth Industrial Revolution. What It Means and How to Respond [Electronic resource] // Foreign Affairs: multiplatform media organization. December 12, 2015. URL: <http://www.foreignaffairs.com/about-foreign-affairs> (date of access: 02.09.2019).

<sup>12</sup> See: Usheva M. N. Talent management in modern human resources management [Electronic resource] // Marketing and management of innovation. 2011. No.3.Vol. 2. pp. 176–177. URL: [http://mmi.fem.sumdu.edu.ua/sites/default/files/mmi2011\\_3\\_2\\_173\\_179.pdf](http://mmi.fem.sumdu.edu.ua/sites/default/files/mmi2011_3_2_173_179.pdf) (date of access: 21.09.2019).

<sup>13</sup> World Economic Forum. Insight Report "The Future of Jobs. Report 2018" [Electronic resource]. P. IX. URL: [http://www3.weforum.org/docs/WEF\\_Future\\_of\\_Jobs\\_2018.pdf](http://www3.weforum.org/docs/WEF_Future_of_Jobs_2018.pdf) (date of access: 21.09.2019) (date of access: 21.09.2019).

- generating ideas;
- the ability to convince, the ability to communicate and negotiate;
- flexibility, emotional intelligence;
- leadership and the ability to exert social influence.

Also, the ability to learn quickly and plan the educational strategy will be important for the employer<sup>14</sup>. Therefore, an urgent task of higher legal education is the formation and development of soft skills as a combination of critical, creative and project thinking, the ability to work in a team, the ability to communicate in any situation, the ability to build multicultural communications, knowledge of foreign languages.

Functional illiteracy is also a serious global problem seen as the inability to read and write at the level necessary to perform the simplest social tasks; including the inability to read the text, find the information necessary for work, understand the meaning of a book or instruction read, write a logically coherent text<sup>15</sup>. It makes it impossible to form critical thinking as a system of judgments used to analyze things and events with the formulation of reasonable conclusions and allows you to make reasonable assessments, interpretations, as well as correctly apply the results obtained to situations and problems<sup>16</sup>.

The study of generational features (using the example of FEFU Law School students) shows the problem of functional illiteracy with at least a fifth of first-year students<sup>17</sup>. As a result, this leads to the inability of students to study university programs effectively that is the inability to form conceptual thinking, self-study and carry out research activities, the development of which is a criterion for obtaining a high level education.

The existing system of Russian higher education, including legal education, is, in the author's opinion, an unsuccessful imitation of American and European models, which arose as a result of mechanistic borrowing within the framework of joining the Bologna process.

Russian universities were forced to squeeze the traditional five-year Soviet model of graduate training into four years. At the same time, the industrial logic of training specialists (relevant for the 20th century) was preserved and the fundamental principles and values of the foreign system from the point of view of organization and approaches to training were not perceived. As a result, we have a linear educational process, like a conveyor production, when a student passes a fixed set of non-competing courses within the framework of stable and inert educational programs. The subjects designed to form the skills of effective thinking, collaboration, leadership and self-learning have a low status. Considering the above, this simulation model cannot meet the modern needs of graduates and employers: the educational program in this format is not able to change, it is difficult to update the content, it is straightforward, that is, it evaluates the student in a rigidly established sequence of exams, than reproduces the practices of endless re-examinations, infantilizing the student and professionally deforming the teacher<sup>18</sup>.

At the present stage there is an awareness of the defectiveness of such a simulation system. The higher education in the Russian Federation is waiting for another serious transformation. In accordance with Federal Law No.273 of 29.12.2012 'On Education in the Russian Federation', the Address of the President of the Russian Federation to the Federal Assembly in 2020, Instructions of the President of the Russian Federation Pr-294 p.2a-16 of 26.02.2019, Pr-113 of 24.01.2020, order of the Ministry of Science and Higher Education No.602 of 23.04.2020 'On Coordinating Councils in Education Spheres', the reform of the architecture of educational programs is to start.

The State Duma of the Russian Federation approved amendments to the Federal Law 'On Education in the Russian Federation' in the first reading. In Article 11, Part 5, it is proposed that federal state educational standards (FSSES) of vocational education can be developed by levels of education or by professions, specialties and areas of training of the corresponding levels of vocational education or enlarged groups of professions, specialties and areas of training, as well as by areas and types of professional activity. The note to the project explains that students are now given the opportunity to obtain several qualifications as part of mastering the main professional educational programs<sup>19</sup>. The Ministry of Science

<sup>14</sup> Op.cit.

<sup>15</sup> Gavriluk, V. V., Sorokin, G. G., Farakhutdinov, Sh. F. Functional Illiteracy in the Context of the Transition to the Information Society. Tyumen': TyumGU. 2009. p. 9–10.

<sup>16</sup> Facione Peter A. Critical Thinking: A Statement of Expert Consensus for Purposes of Educational Assessment and Instruction. Executive Summary [Electronic resource] // The Delphi Report. The Complete American Philosophical Association Delphi Research Report.P. 4. Queensborough Community College.N-Y. 1990. URL: <http://www.qcc.cuny.edu/SocialSciences/ppecorino/CT-Expert-Report.pdf> (date of access: 25.01.2019).

<sup>17</sup> See: Dorofeeva, M. A. Strategies of Independent Work of First-Year Students of the FEFU Law School As a Manifestation of the Characteristics of Generation Z // IV Pacific Legal Forum, dedicated to the celebration of the 60th anniversary of continuous legal education at the Far Eastern Federal University and the 99th anniversary of legal education in the Far East of Russia. October 2–4, 2018. Vladivostok: Far Eastern Federal University. 2018. P. 79.

<sup>18</sup> See: Shcherbenok A. University Management. The educational process at the university: bachelor's degree. Russian baccalaureate as an educational pipe: an online course. Lecture 2. (MOOC) [Electronic resource] // Moscow School of Management SKOLKOVO. URL: <https://online.skolkovo.ru> (date of access: 15.04.2017).

<sup>19</sup> On amendments to the Federal Law "On Education in the Russian Federation" in terms of improving the regulation of the application of professional standards in the field of vocational education: draft law No. 1076089–7 (adopted in the first reading on 10.03.2021) [Electronic resource] // Official website of the State Duma of the Federal Assembly of the Russian Federation. URL: <https://sozd.duma.gov.ru/bill/1076089-7> (date of access: 09.04.2021).

and Higher Education, when recruiting for higher education programs in 2021–2022, is allowed to hold a competition, among other things, in several professions and (or) areas of training within an enlarged group of professions or areas of training<sup>20</sup>.

Thus, if the students join the university by competition within the enlarged group of professions in the second year they will have to choose a specific area of training. When the amendments to the law 'On Education in the Russian Federation' are adopted, each student will be entitled to an additional qualification, which is called minor educational track in foreign practice. Thus, the planned changes in the educational legislation will lead to the fact that the curriculum of each student will be initially individual and unique.

In this regard, we can say that it is actually planned to switch to the principles of organizing the education of the classical American baccalaureate. One of them is the controlled freedom of the student in choosing a discipline through the formats of a free curriculum, a core program and / or a free distribution. With a free curriculum, the student chooses an approved number of any courses within the organizational requirements. In the core program, the student goes through the entire range of disciplines according to a pre-approved plan, and only after that he has the opportunity to choose a specialization. Core disciplines should form a certain integrative model of professional competence, including clusters of universal knowledge, functional and behavioral (social) characteristics. This model was crystallized by the research and practice of scientists and educators in the USA, Great Britain and France<sup>21</sup>. The next option is a model of distributive requirements, when the organization of the educational process implies that the best way to introduce a student to a particular subject area of science is not to lecture a single course, but to allow the student to choose a topic that interests him and immerse himself in the subject area<sup>22</sup>.

Thus, the student is given the right to determine the sphere of professional interests after entering the university. To do this, the student finds himself in a situation of ensuring the breadth of educational requirements. The breadth of requirements can be provided through core and / or distributive requirements: obligatory courses in which all students are required to familiarize themselves with important research methods or approaches to knowledge and / or classical humanitarian texts. There is also a variant of the broad education, when students are required to immerse themselves in a certain number of subject areas, but they choose specific disciplines themselves<sup>23</sup>. The author has come across options from five to twelve areas in the academic requirements of American universities.

The depth of study of the subject area assumes that the future graduate is immersed in a certain set of basic professional disciplines studied in a certain sequence with different levels of complexity (major). Additional qualifications (and a unique combination of competencies for the labor market) are provided by the choice of subjects from non-adjacent fields of knowledge (minor).

In the author's opinion, modern education based on the model of Liberal Arts and Sciences (LAS) is a relevant model of the higher education system that can overcome the challenges facing the world higher education in the 21st century. However, it should be understood that the LAS model is one model in a number of models<sup>24</sup>, which is based on the fundamental principle of the organization of the educational process in higher educational institutions in America that is the individualization of the educational trajectory. The individual educational trajectory as a whole reflects a flexible approach to the student's formation of his training as the initial stage of the career management process. According to Natalia Shumkova, Deputy First Vice-Rector of the HSE, Director of the Center for Corporate Training at the HSE Graduate School of Business, career management is a basic tool for implementing the idea of lifelong learning. It is also applicable to the formation of a lawyer's professional identity at all stages of career management<sup>25</sup>.

It is important to note that the LAS model is not just the architecture of an educational program. It exists only if the 'unity of the management system, the principles of building the curriculum and the pedagogical approaches used' is observed<sup>26</sup>. In general, it is 'a system of higher education designed to educate students with the desire and ability to learn, think critically and express their thoughts skillfully, as well as to educate citizens who are able to become active participants in a democratic society. Such a system is distinguished by a flexible curriculum that combines the width of the disciplinary scope with the

<sup>20</sup> On approval of the Procedure for admission to higher education educational programs — bachelor's degree programs, specialty programs, Master's programs: order of the Ministry of Science and Higher Education of the Russian Federation No. 1076 of August 21, 2020 [Electronic resource] // <url> GARANT.RU portal URL: <https://www.garant.ru/products/ipo/prime/doc/74441661/> (date of access: 09.04. 2021).

<sup>21</sup> See: Mitin, A. N. Architecture of Managerial and Legal Work Competencies. Yekaterinburg: USLUA. 2013. p. 46–52.

<sup>22</sup> See: Shcherbenok A. Ibid. [electronic resource]. URL: <https://online.skolkovo.ru> (date of access: 15.04.2017).

<sup>23</sup> Becker, J. What a Liberal Arts and Sciences Education is and is Not // Liberal Arts and Sciences at the Present Stage: the Experience of the United States and Europe in the Context of Russian Education. Saint Petersburg: SPbGU. 2014. P. 23.

<sup>24</sup> In the US Bachelor's degree there are general degrees and degrees indicating the subject area. The general bachelor's degrees include Bachelor of Arts (BA — in the field of humanities, social sciences and arts) and Bachelor of Science (BS — in the field of technical, mathematic and natural sciences). Bachelor's degrees with an indication of the subject area can be research (Bachelor of Science in Public Affairs, etc.) and professional (Bachelor of Engineering, Bachelor of Architecture, etc.).

<sup>25</sup> Section 'Problems of legal education in the new world'. International Conference 'Globalization and Law: problems of forming Global Legal Skills'. Faculty of Law of the Higher School of Economics. Moscow, March 25, 2021 00: 17: 54–00:51:20. [Electronic resource] URL: <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=PtdAEMd5sKI&list=PL7B5LIC4JvJdBmxA77JAQvzvGMgNsB24u&index=2&t=2618s> (date of access: 30.03.2021).

<sup>26</sup> Becker J. Ibid. p. 16.

depth of the subject study, encourages inter-disciplinarity and provides students with maximum freedom of choice. In addition, the model is distributed through student-oriented pedagogic, interactive and involving students in working with texts both in the classroom and outside it<sup>27</sup>.

Leo Botstein, President of Bard College, one of the leading American universities with a LAS program, says 'These days, the boundaries between scientific disciplines are blurring. This applies to Law, Medicine, and especially to Sciences — Chemistry, Biology, Physics, since advanced research areas, for example, in Biology imply a mandatory knowledge of Physics and Chemistry. Even if we proceed from the belief that it is necessary to study only what is really necessary for the student in his future professional activity, modern students need to expand their ideas about the knowledge they need from the very beginning. This model of education is the opposite of the system, which involves passing several obligatory stages established by previous generations and recognized as an official way of obtaining a professional status. Thus, if you want to become a more qualified lawyer, businessman, doctor, innovation specialist or engineer, education based on the Liberal arts and sciences model offers you the best way to develop creative and innovative abilities and to get more competitive professional training'<sup>28</sup>.

As an example of the syncretism and inter-disciplinarity of a particular profession, he gives the profession of a lawyer. 'Any lawyer today should have knowledge in the field of natural sciences and biology, as well as computer and information literacy.

He will have to deal with cases related to patents and patient treatment, freedom of speech and dissemination of information, intellectual property and copyright. If he is completely ignorant of technology and science, he will be helpless when considering specific cases. If someone sues the company in connection with an illness caused by working conditions, and the lawyer does not even know where to start and how to understand the possible causes of this illness, he will be forced to rely on the opinion of an expert. The task of liberal education is, among other things, to provide students with basic scientific knowledge, even if they have chosen Humanities'<sup>29</sup>.

However, for the LAS model, the situation of an increased role of specialization (major) in comparison with the breadth of education is unacceptable. But due to the complexity of the legal profession, the emphasis on professional disciplines is characteristic of legal education all over the world. And it is clear that it is impossible to use the LAS model directly when teaching lawyers. However, for example, American law schools and colleges have solved this problem brilliantly: they allow to get law degrees and start professional activity only for those who already have a bachelor's degree. That is, the American legal education wants to see its entrant with the formed qualities of a certain humanitarian and / or natural science training, analytics, critical thinking, functional competence of the level of academic text and writing, etc.

Considering the facts it is also not possible to use the LAS educational model in conjunction with Russian legal education. However, one of its central elements is teaching as pedagogy. Therefore, from our point of view, we can talk about the use of LAS educational technology in higher legal education. By educational technology, the author understands the model and the real process of implementing an integral pedagogical activity. Within the framework of this activity, the teacher is clearly aware of the target settings and orientations, the main ideas and principles, determines and understands the position of the student in the educational process, on the basis of which communication is carried out. He builds learning goals, which correlate with the content of the educational material, its didactic structure and forms of presentation. Accordingly, the conceptual and target bases dictate the specifics of methods and means of teaching, motivational characteristics, organizational forms of training, and determine the features of educational process management<sup>30</sup>.

The conceptual basis of LAS educational technology is the creation of space and conditions for the formation of critical thinking and an active public civil position. The pedagogical goal can be recognized as improving the analytical abilities of students through a methodological model: when teachers introduce students to various points of view on the subject, with various theoretical approaches, they require students to read texts critically<sup>31</sup>. However critical thinking cannot arise from emptiness. In order to have something to operate within reasoned arguments, it is necessary to fill knowledge with specific facts, hypotheses, concepts. In this regard, the role of independent training of students is growing. Any interactive lesson is doomed to failure if students have not independently learned the materials for the class.

For the education of lawyers (bachelors and masters), LAS educational technology, from our point of view, is relevant when studying within the framework of fundamental disciplines — those that lay the foundation for professional legal thinking (introduction into the profession, theory of state and law, history of state and law, professional ethics of a lawyer, philosophy of law, history of political and legal doctrines, history of legal science, methodology of scientific research in the field of jurisprudence, comparative law, etc.). All pedagogical practices of the LAS model are based on the relationship of thinking and writing, and only a well-developed written speech allows for the procedures of critical and divergent thinking and is the basis for successful oral speech.

<sup>27</sup> Ibid, p. 17.

<sup>28</sup> Interview with the President of Bard College Leon Botstein// *Voprosy obrazovaniya*. 2015. No.4.p. 12.

<sup>29</sup> Ibid. p.15.

<sup>30</sup> Gorovaya V.I., Petrova N.F. Educational technologies and technological culture of a modern teacher// *Modern high-tech technologies*. 2008. No.10. pp. 35–36.

<sup>31</sup> Becker J. Ibid. p. 24.

Fareed Zakaria, an American political analyst, editor of *Newsweek International* magazine, was proud of his interaction with the LAS system as a student. 'Its main value is that it teaches you to express your thoughts in writing... a liberal education teaches you to think, and thinking and writing are inextricably linked.' 'Another significant advantage ... consists in the fact that it teaches you to speak and express your thoughts.' 'And finally, ... it teaches you to learn — to read on a variety of subjects, to find and analyze information'<sup>32</sup>. At first glance, these are expected goals of studying at any higher educational institution. However, special techniques are required for the purposeful formation of such abilities. The methodological center that develops such methods is Bard College.

It ranks first in the American national educational rating of colleges that implement the most advanced educational standards of study in the field of Liberal Arts and Sciences. In the overall rating of the leading US colleges in the field of Liberal Arts and Sciences Bard College was ranked 62nd (out of 400 in the first division) in 2020<sup>33</sup>.

The key principle of LAS educational technology is as follows: writing is a unique way of learning, it is able to define and convey and, indeed, defines and transmits experience. Language provides a unique way of cognition and becomes a tool for revealing meanings, transmitting thoughts and comprehension both in the audience and outside it. Through the educational practices of Bard College, a stable connection between thought and its expression is formed. Reading, writing and creative tasks make students understand what critical thinking is, and instill in them the culture of thinking necessary for intellectual growth and a successful career<sup>34</sup>.

A study by the Carnegie Fund in collaboration with Vanderbilt University showed that writing contributes to a better understanding of what is read, because 'students learn to link what they read, what they know and what they think'. The tasks 'write to read' feed the sense of self-identity, strengthen vitality and involvement', because they help students to realize allusions, motivations and associations in their own texts. The US National Commission on writing points out: 'If students are faced with the task of extracting knowledge, they must struggle with facts, overcome details, process raw material and translate obscure concepts into a language in which they can convey them to someone else. In a word, if students want to study, they must write'<sup>35</sup>.

The communicative goal of classes within the framework of LAS educational technology is to create such an educational space that allows to form 'a certain model of mental behavior, a certain mindset that students need in order not to stop learning throughout their lives, to be able to think critically, to think interdisciplinary. In addition, such a seminar is a kind of laboratory where students work with each other, really learn to read a text, no matter the topic, and then not just retell or pointlessly repeat this text, but ask questions to it and raise new questions based on the text they read. This is critical thinking'<sup>36</sup>.

Within the framework of fundamental legal courses, many methods developed at Bard College can be used. In the arsenal of the author of the article there are about twenty of them<sup>37</sup>. They assume the transformation of the thought at first exclusively into a written text, and only after a written presentation a collective discussion of the results is possible. But students can voice their ideas and judgments (at the time of their publication) only according to the written text. It should be noted that any object of research can be used for 'reading' instead of the text (video series [film, cartoon], artifact-object, image, etc.)

The advantage of the entire set of methods (as an educational LAS technology) is that you can create your own derived methods based on them, observing the fundamental principles:

- reproduction of the connection between thinking and writing;
- equality of all participants in the class, the value of the right to speak;
- intellectual collaboration of students;
- algorithmization of the thought process (that is, step-by-step implementation of exercises);
- the teacher acts as a facilitator through questions and reflection.

The following methods can be used as classical in legal disciplines. Actually, free writing for 5–10 minutes allows you to tune the thinking, clearing it of focus, and transfer it to a working state for solving analytical problems. It is good to use it at the beginning of any classes where there is written work (not at the exam).

Writing to Read allows you to get into the text, recording the results of analytical reading in writing. In fact, the method allows you to enter into a dialogue with the author of the text, while maintaining the freedom of your thinking. Students realize that they are in a dialogue with the text when, as part of a joint group work, there is a discussion of the author's thesis, which, according to each teacher, is the main one. And it turns out that there are a great many 'basic theses'. And it is very easy to get out of this position into the situation of 'appropriating' the text, giving it its own meaning, and then searching for identity with other colleagues-students during the discussion.

<sup>32</sup> Zakaria, F. Why Are the Liberal Arts So Important // *Liberal Arts and Sciences at the Present Stage: the Experience of the United States and Europe in the Context of Russian Education*. Saint Petersburg: SPbGU. 2014. P. 110–111.

<sup>33</sup> U.S. News & World Report L. P. [Electronic resource]. URL: <https://www.usnews.com/best-colleges/bard-college-2671/overall-rankings> (date of access: 20.06.2020).

<sup>34</sup> See: Peoples P. The development of speech and critical thinking among students in the programs of Bard College // *Questions of Education*. 2015. No.4. pp. 117–118.

<sup>35</sup> Peoples P. Ibid. p. 127.

<sup>36</sup> Interview with the Rector of the University of Richmond Ronald Krucher // *Voprosy obrazovaniya*. 2015. No.4.p. 29.

<sup>37</sup> Teaching methods of Liberal Arts and Sciences took place at the Faculty of Liberal Arts and Sciences of St. Petersburg State University, tutor E. Galazanova.



Believing and Doubting helps the student to realize that a problem or a thesis can be ambiguous and multi-layered, that argumentation is not just "my opinion",

but a complex, formalized, often logically ordered chain of reasoning that necessarily expresses an unobvious judgment about the world<sup>38</sup>. And the use of the devil's advocate method often breaks the students' idea of their value judgment as the only correct one.

Dialectical Response Notebooks provide dialogical interaction of two or three people. They can work and exchange thoughts about the individual meanings found in the text in an interactive mode.

Free Narrative Writing works great. This method was applied to the normative legal act of the branch of criminal law, and students described their state as criminal law institution. There is a setting in the position of 'the other', the use of knowledge of criminal law to create an adequate 'I-story', the use of different styles of the Russian language for the story.

It is very interesting to use the technique of writing from images. This method is applied by the author in two classes (in relation to a normative legal act and a film that captures, among other things, the legal reality). It can also be used in the study of texts within the framework of the philosophy of law, the history of political and legal doctrines, etc., in any legal disciplines where the objects are concepts and ideas. Personal attitude to the text, its assignment by students occurs through a number of images evoked by the text. With the help of a teacher-facilitator, through questions, the student builds a chain of images in accordance with a certain logic. In the course of the work, students talk about their 'written' thoughts. At the end of the exercise stage, the obtained elements can be arranged in a different sequence (cut and re-glue the paper), then again conduct a revision of the text on the teacher's questions. Also, if there is time, students can exchange newborn texts with each other, get feedback and improve the text once again. In fact, the final product will be an original essay on the topic under study, which has not been compiled or borrowed from the Internet and is an absolutely original work. Some students are very surprised that they were able to create a text without the help of surfing the net.

A serious disadvantage when using such methods, which involve checking a large number of student papers and writing detailed reviews on them, is an increase in the rate of exploitation of teaching work<sup>39</sup>. Verification of the written results of independent work can be effective only if it has a certain methodological basis developed by the teacher independently. In the working programs of disciplines, as a rule, the forms of verification as types of work are written down, their total labor intensity is often calculated. However, in reality, this type of work activity of the teacher is practically not paid and is carried out at the expense of either current, and most often pre-examination consultations, or personal time of the teacher, which reduces its quality<sup>40</sup>. It is legally defined that the educational activity of an organization implies the format of independent work<sup>41</sup>, however, the verification of written works as the results of independent work of students (IW in the curricula) is not defined as a type of labor activity ('contact work', 'academic load')<sup>42</sup>, which allows organizations to ignore it or arbitrarily determine the standards of labor costs in certain areas of training / specialties (providing for drawing and graphic work). In fact, this type of work is translated into an individual work of teachers, which creates problems taking into account his real labor costs<sup>43</sup>.

In the context of the pandemic, within the framework of online training, the author applied LAS techniques in combination with competence certifications in the format of a written creative essay on problematic topics and a 'blind review' (peer-to-peer). This made it possible to test the students skills and abilities to read functionally and competently, select adequate sources, identify and present arguments, build a system of judgments for analysis with the formulation of reasonable conclusions, make reasonable assessments, interpretations, and also removed the problem of cheating or plagiarism, since the creation of original essays made surfing the Internet meaningless and similar techniques were immediately noticeable in the texts. However, this personal experience has revealed the following: a huge amount of time is needed to check the results of students and provide adequate academic feedback. 746 texts of student papers (essays and reviews) were checked for 2.5 months. And traditionally, this activity is not formally recorded in the pedagogic work of the teacher in any way.

<sup>38</sup> Blusiewicz, T. Russian Students through the Eyes of Foreign Professors [Electronic resource] // The School of Advanced Studies (SAS). The University of Tyumen. URL: [https://sas.utmn.ru/russian-students/?fbclid=iwar2tdtgaxaqmme3ortfmdaiona45tn6srfayvh2u9sbyc\\_gywbarrkmopa](https://sas.utmn.ru/russian-students/?fbclid=iwar2tdtgaxaqmme3ortfmdaiona45tn6srfayvh2u9sbyc_gywbarrkmopa)

<sup>39</sup> See: Ivanova, Y., Sokolov, P. Prospects for Liberal Arts Education Development in Russian Universities. Overview of Proceedings of the Liberal Education in Russia and the World Conference // Educational Studies. 2015. No.4. pp. 87–88.

<sup>40</sup> Bessolitsin, A. A., Monakhov, V. A. Ensuring the Quality of Education in Higher Education Institutions — the Search for New Approaches // Questions of the New Economy. 2013. No.3 (27). P.78.

<sup>41</sup> On approval of the Procedure for Organizing and Implementing Educational Activities for educational programs of higher education — bachelor's degree programs, specialty programs, Master's degree programs: Order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Russian Federation No.301 of April 5, 2017 (with amendments and additions). Appendix. The order of organization and implementation of educational activities for educational programs of higher education — bachelor's degree programs, specialty programs, master's degree programs [Electronic resource] // GARANT.RU portal. URL: <https://base.garant.ru/71721568/53f89241bbdaf741eb2d1ecc4ddb4c33/> (date of access: 09.04.2021).

<sup>42</sup> On the duration of working hours (norms of hours of pedagogical work for the salary rate) of pedagogical workers and on the procedure for determining the educational load of pedagogical workers stipulated in the employment contract: order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Russian Federation of December 22, 2014 N 1601 (with amendments and additions). Appendix No.1. Duration of working hours (norms of hours of pedagogical work for the salary rate) of pedagogical workers [Electronic resource] // GARANT.RU Portal URL: <https://base.garant.ru/70878632/53f89421bbdaf741eb2d1ecc4ddb4c33/> (date of access: 09.04.2021).

<sup>43</sup> Kabanov, V. N. Labor Rationing in Higher Educational Institutions // Economics of Education. 2013. No.2. p. 46.

Thus, the use of educational technologies of the Liberal Arts and Sciences model in legal education allows us to fulfill the tasks of teaching functional literacy, creating stable relationships between thinking and written speech, instilling a culture of thinking, forming critical thinking, gaining successful experience of intellectual collaboration, the ability to discuss and tolerate someone else's picture of the world. This meets the current challenges of the labor market of the new digital world. However, possible innovations in the use of LAS educational technology come into conflict with the current organization of teachers' labor in Russian universities.

## References

1. Becker, J. What a Liberal Arts and Sciences Education is and is Not // Liberal Arts and Sciences at the Present Stage: the Experience of the United States and Europe in the Context of Russian Education [Svobodnye iskusstva i nauki na sovremennom etape: opyt SSHA i Evropy v kontekste rossijskogo obrazovaniya]. Saint Petersburg : SPbGU. 2014. P. 12–40. (in rus)
2. Bessolitsin, A. A., Monakhov, V. A. Ensuring the Quality of Education in Higher Education Institutions — the Search for New Approaches // Questions of the New Economy [Voprosy novoj ekonomiki]. 2013. No.3 (27). P. 73–80. (in rus)
3. Blusiewicz, T. Russian Students through the Eyes of Foreign Professors [Electronic resource] [Rossijskie studenty glazami inostrannykh professorov] // The School of Advanced Studies (SAS). The University of Tyumen. URL: [https://sas.utmn.ru/russian-students/?fbclid=iwar2tdtgaxaqmme3ortfmdaiona45tn6srfa9yh2u9sbyc\\_qywbarrkmopa](https://sas.utmn.ru/russian-students/?fbclid=iwar2tdtgaxaqmme3ortfmdaiona45tn6srfa9yh2u9sbyc_qywbarrkmopa) (accessed: 16.05.2020). (in rus)
4. Dorofeeva, M. A. Strategies of Independent Work of First-Year Students of the FEFU Law School As a Manifestation of the Characteristics of Generation Z // IV Pacific Legal Forum, dedicated to the celebration of the 60th anniversary of continuous legal education at the Far Eastern Federal University and the 99th anniversary of legal education in the Far East of Russia. October 2–4, 2018 [IV Tihookeanskij yuridicheskij forum, posvyashchennyj prazdnovaniyu 60–letiya nepreryvnogo yuridicheskogo obrazovaniya v Dal'nevostochnom federal'nom universitete i 99–letiyu yuridicheskogo obrazovaniya na Dal'nem Vostoke Rossii. 2–4 oktyabrya 2018 goda]. Vladivostok : Far Eastern Federal University. 2018. P. 77–82. (in rus)
5. Gavriluk, V. V., Sorokin, G. G., Farakhutdinov, Sh. F. Functional Illiteracy in the Context of the Transition to the Information Society [Funkcional'naya negramotnost' v usloviyah perekhoda k informacionnomu obshchestvu]. Tyumen' : TyumGU. 2009. 244 p. (in rus)
6. Interview with the President of Bard College Leon Botstein // Educational Studies. 2015. No.4. P. 11–20. (in rus)
7. Interview with the Rector of the University of Richmond Ronald Krucher // Educational Studies. 2015. No.4. P. 21–32. (in rus)
8. Ivanova, Y., Sokolov, P. Prospects for Liberal Arts Education Development in Russian Universities. Overview of Proceedings of the Liberal Education in Russia and the World Conference // Educational Studies. 2015. No.4. P. 7291. DOI: 10.17323/1814–9545–2015–4–72–91. (in rus)
9. Kabanov, V. N. Labor Rationing in Higher Educational Institutions // Economics of Education [Ekonomika obrazovaniya]. 2013. No.2. P. 42–48. (in rus)
10. Mitin, A. N. Architecture of Managerial and Legal Work Competencies [Arhitektura kompetencij upravlencheskogo i yuridicheskogo truda]. Yekaterinburg : USLUA. 2013. 166 p. (in rus)
11. Peoples, P. Empowering Students through Language & Critical Thinking: the Bard College Language & Thinking Program [Razvitie rechi i kriticheskogo myshleniya u studentov v programmah Bard-kolledzha] // Educational Studies. 2015. No.4. P. 116–131. (in rus)
12. Shcherbenok, A. University Management [Upravlenie universitetami]: MOOC [Electronic resource] // Moscow School of Management SKOLKOVO. URL: <https://online.skolkovo.ru> (accessed: 15.04.2017). (in rus)
13. Usheva, M. N. Talent Management in Modern Human Resource Management [Electronic resource] // Marketing and Management Innovation [Marketing i menedzhment innovacij]. 2011. No.3. Vol. 2. P. 176–177. URL: [http://mmi.fem.sumdu.edu.ua/sites/default/files/mmi2011\\_3\\_2\\_173\\_179.pdf](http://mmi.fem.sumdu.edu.ua/sites/default/files/mmi2011_3_2_173_179.pdf) (accessed: 21.09.2019). (in rus)
14. Zakaria, F. Why Are the Liberal Arts So Important // Liberal Arts and Sciences at the Present Stage: the Experience of the United States and Europe in the Context of Russian Education [Svobodnye iskusstva i nauki na sovremennom etape: opyt SSHA i Evropy v kontekste rossijskogo obrazovaniya]. Saint Petersburg : SPbGU. 2014. P. 110–111. (in rus)
15. Facione, Peter A. Critical Thinking: A Statement of Expert Consensus for Purposes of Educational Assessment and Instruction. Executive Summary // The Delphi Report. The Complete American Philosophical Association Delphi Research Report [Electronic resource]. Queensborough Community College. N-Y. 1990. URL: <http://www.qcc.cuny.edu/SocialSciences/ppecorino/CT-Expert-Report.pdf> (accessed: 25.01.2019).
16. Schwab, Klaus. The Fourth Industrial Revolution. What It Means and How to Respond [Electronic resource] / Foreign Affairs: Multiplatform Media Organization. December 12, 2015. URL: <https://www.foreignaffairs.com/about-foreign-affairs> (accessed: 02.09.2019).
17. World Economic Forum. Insight Report “The Future of Jobs. Report 2018” [Electronic resource]. P. IX. URL: [http://www3.weforum.org/docs/WEF\\_Future\\_of\\_Jobs\\_2018.pdf](http://www3.weforum.org/docs/WEF_Future_of_Jobs_2018.pdf) (accessed: 21.09.2019).